



THE CORPORATION OF THE UNITED TOWNSHIPS OF

# HEAD, CLARA & MARIA

15 Township Hall Road  
STONECLIFFE, ONTARIO, K0J 2K0

Phone: (613) 586-2526 | Fax: (613) 586-2596 | E-mail: [twpshcm@xplornet.com](mailto:twpshcm@xplornet.com), Treasurer: [treasurer@xplornet.com](mailto:treasurer@xplornet.com)

## Sealed Bids - 2013 Plowing Contract Opening

By signing and witnessing the following we hereby attest to the fact that the following proposals were received as per bidder package instructions and prior to Friday, March 15, 2013 at 12:00 noon.

It is further witnessed that the bids were opened at 12:05 p.m. Friday, March 15, 2013. The lowest bid is not necessarily accepted; other factors are to be considered as described in the tender documents.

Bidder	Date and Time Received	Proposed Bid	Comments as to compliance etc.
EASTWAY	MAR 15/13 11:43am	\$137/HR plow \$350.31/B 29.75/tonne	} Seems complete "
CRUICKSHANK	MAR 15/13 11:02am	\$100/HR 9000 3/B	
M LANCE	MAR 15/13 11:37	101.04/HR 72.04/5/B	\$21.04/5/s "
? STEWART	MAR 15/13 10:14	119.74/HR 75/DAY	\$05/5/s "

Municipal Clerk, Melinda Reith

Municipal Treasurer, Noella Lebreton

*Flawing*  
**Contract Assessment Review – Grading 2013**

Schedule “D”

**CONTRACT ASSESSMENT REVIEW**

Although a tender for a service is often awarded on the basis of price alone, this is dependent on all other issues being equal or consistent. When all other conditions are not equal, such as when a new bidder is being considered other issues may hold more weight namely:

- Obtaining maximum value for dollars spent;
  - Price per hour;
  - Cost of Salt/Sand per tonne;
- Minimizing employee time and effort expended;
  - Training, orientation;
- Ensuring improved service and support;
  - References – reliability – experience;
- Ensuring product delivery, quality, efficiency and effectiveness;
  - Availability of Salt/Sand – location, storage and loading on vehicles;
  - Proximity of vehicles/drivers to municipality – guarantee of service delivery;

If you feel that you may score in a negative way for any of the reasons listed, please provide a breakdown of how you and your business will work to resolve issues or meet requirements. Example, have drivers and equipment within the community although your business is not in the area. The municipality has legislated time lines to meet in responding to winter events and requires its contractor to be in a position to respond to all events at all times meeting the minimum maintenance standards 100%.

**Scoring:**

1. A scoring system as detailed below will be used to assist in the selection process. All conditions of the Agreement and Tender documents must be met.
2. If the response meets the following requirements, an award of 15 points will be given; only partially meets

requirements – 10 points; and does not meet requirements – 5 points; for each of the following considerations.

3. Considerations and examples:

- Price; (e.g. Lowest price would receive 15, Highest – 5)
- Stand by day rate;
- References/experience; (e.g. evidence of similar positive work history – 15, No experience/new operator -5)
- Condition/age of equipment; (e.g. Newer equipment – 15, Older – 5)
- Availability/ Detail of Backup Plan/Equipment; (e.g. Contingencies detailed for loss of equipment and/or operator – 15, no plan/equipment – 5)
- Availability of or access to sand/salt supply – (e.g. 15 for within the municipality, 5 – for distance further from municipality)
- Proximity of drivers/equipment to the municipality for appropriate response times
- Other consideration which may be recommended by Council.

	Bidder #1	Score	Bidder #2	Score	Bidder #3	Score	Bidder #4	Score
	<b>Eastway Contracting</b>		<b>Cruickshank</b>		<b>Michael Lance</b>		<b>Pat Stewart</b>	
<b>Price per hour</b>	\$137/hr	5	\$160/hr	0	\$101.04/hr	15	\$119.74/hr	10
<b>Stand By Rate</b>	\$350/day	0	\$200/day	5	\$72.04/day	15	\$75/day	10
<b>Cost per tonne sand/salt</b>	\$29.75/tonne	0	\$10/sand \$79.50/salt	5	\$21.04	15	\$25	10
<b>References</b>	None provided	5	List provided	15	None provided	5	None required - HCM	15
<b>Experience - Plowing roads</b>	None provided	5	Extensive	15	None	5	Extensive for this municipality	15
<b>Experience - similar road maintenance work</b>	None provided	5	Extensive	15	None provided	5	Extensive for this municipality	15
<b>Condition/Age of Equipment</b>	1992/2000 or newer	5	2003/2012	15	1997/1993	10	2002/1998	10
<b>Availability/Detail of Backup Plan</b>	Internal with back up in Deep River	15	High Road	15	Use spare truck	10	2 trucks on at one time + back up.	15
<b>Availability of sand/salt</b>	Not addressed	5	Stonecliffe yard	15	Not addressed	5	Pt, Alexander and Mackey	15
<b>Proximity of drivers to the municipality</b>	Local?	10	Local?	10	Local?	10	Pt, Alexander	10
<b>Other considerations - completeness of original tender/missing information</b>	Had to call for references. No list of references or similar experience received with bid.	5	Complete tender docs.	15	Had to call for references. No list of references or similar experience received with bid.	5	Complete tender docs.	15
<b>Total</b>		60		125		100		140

*M. Carter*  
MAR 04 19/13

	Bidder #1	Score	Bidder #2	Score	Bidder #3	Score	Bidder #4	Score
	<b>Eastway Contracting</b>		<b>Cruickshank</b>		<b>Michael Lance</b>		<b>Pat Stewart</b>	
Price per hour	\$137/hr	10	\$160/hr	0	\$101.04/hr	15	\$119.74/hr	15
Stand By Rate	\$350/day	0	\$200/day	5	\$72.04/day	15	\$75/day	10
Cost per tonne sand/salt	\$29.75/tonne	5	\$10/sand \$79.50/salt	0	\$21.04	15	\$25	10
References	None provided	5	List provided	15	None provided	5	None required - HCM	15
Experience - Plowing roads	None provided	5	Extensive	15	None	5	Extensive for this municipality	15
Experience - similar road maintenance work	None provided	5	Extensive	15	None provided	5	Extensive for this municipality	15
Condition/Age of Equipment	1992/2000 or newer	10	2003/2012	15	1997/1993	5	2002/1998	10
Availability/Detail of Backup Plan	Internal with back up in Deep River	10	High Road	10	Use spare truck	5	2 trucks on at one time + back up.	15
Availability of sand/salt	Not addressed	5	Stonecliffe yard	10	Not addressed	5	Pt. Alexander and Mackey	15
Proximity of drivers to the municipality	Local?	5	Local?	5	Local?	5	Pt. Alexander	15
Other considerations - completeness of original tender/missing information	Had to call for references. No list of references or similar experience received with bid.	5	Complete tender docs.	15	Had to call for references. No list of references or similar experience received with bid.	5	Complete tender docs.	15
<b>Total</b>	<b>60</b>		<b>105</b>		<b>85</b>		<b>145</b>	

*AG March 19/13*